THE NAVAJO NATION LEGISLATIVE BRANCH INTERNET PUBLIC REVIEW PUBLICATION



LEGISLATION NO: _0002-22__ SPONSOR: <u>Eugene Tso</u>

TITLE: An Action Relating to the Resources and Development, the Health, Education, and Human Services, The Law and Order, and the Naabik'íyáti' Committees, and to the Navajo Nation Council; Amending Title 17 of the Navajo Nation Code to Establish Criminal Penalties for Vicious Dog and Other Animal Attacks

Date posted: January 07, 2022 at 4:50PM

Digital comments may be e-mailed to comments@navajo-nsn.gov

Written comments may be mailed to:

Executive Director
Office of Legislative Services
P.O. Box 3390
Window Rock, AZ 86515
(928) 871-7586

Comments may be made in the form of chapter resolutions, letters, position papers, etc. Please include your name, position title, address for written comments; a valid e-mail address is required. Anonymous comments will not be included in the Legislation packet.

Please note: This digital copy is being provided for the benefit of the Navajo Nation chapters and public use. Any political use is prohibited. All written comments received become the property of the Navajo Nation and will be forwarded to the assigned Navajo Nation Council standing committee(s) and/or the Navajo Nation Council for review. Any tampering with public records are punishable by Navajo Nation law pursuant to 17 N.N.C. *§374 et. seq.*

LEGISLATION SUMMARY SHEET

DATE: January 6, 2022

TITLE OF LEGISLATION: AN ACTION RELATING TO THE RESOURCES AND DEVELOPMENT, THE HEALTH, EDUCATION, AND HUMAN SERVICES, THE LAW AND ORDER, AND THE NAABIK'ÍYÁTI' COMMITTEES, AND TO THE NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL; AMENDING TITLE 17 OF THE NAVAJO NATION CODE TO ESTABLISH CRIMINAL PENALTIES FOR VICIOUS DOG AND OTHER ANIMAL ATTACKS

PURPOSE OF THIS LEGISLATION: to amend Title 17 of the Navajo Nation Code to specify a criminal nuisance offense and establish criminal penalties for vicious dogs and other dangerous animals running at large that cause injury or death.

| | OLD PERIOD: Resources & Development Co | |
|---------------|--|---------|
| osting End | | Thence |
| ligible for A | | Thence |
| 1 | PROPOSED NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL RESOLUTION Law & Order Co | mmittee |
| 2 | 24th NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL - Fourth Year, 2022 | Thence |
| 3 | Introduced by: | Thence |
| 4 | Navajo Nation | |
| 5 | - Congress | |
| 6 | Prime Sponsor) | |
| 7 | 16 Monday of | |
| 8 | Tracking No. 0002-22 | |
| 9 | Since | |
| 10 | AN ACTION | |
| 11 | RELATING TO THE RESOURCES AND DEVELOPMENT, THE HEALTH, | |
| 12 | EDUCATION, AND HUMAN SERVICES, THE LAW AND ORDER, AND THE | |
| 13 | NAABIK'ÍYÁTI' COMMITTEES, AND TO THE NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL; | |
| 14 | AMENDING TITLE 17 OF THE NAVAJO NATION CODE TO ESTABLISH | |
| 15 | CRIMINAL PENALTIES FOR VICIOUS DOG AND OTHER ANIMAL ATTACKS | |
| 16 | | |
| 17 | BE IT ENACTED: | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | SECTION ONE. AUTHORITY | |
| 20 | A. The Resources and Development Committee is a Standing Committee of the Navajo Nation | |
| 21 | Council with statutory authority over the Division of Natural Resources ("DNR"). 2 N.N.C. | |
| 22 | §501(C). The Department of Fish and Wildlife is within the DNR and the Navajo Nation's | |
| 23 | Animal Control Program is under the Department of Fish and Wildlife. 13 N.N.C. | |
| 24 | §1700(B)(1), Resolution No. CJY-64-18. The Resources and Development Committee | |
| 25 | recommends to the Navajo Nation Council the approval of resolutions that will accomplish | |
| 26 | the Committee's purposes. 2 N.N.C. §501(B)(4)(f). | |
| 27 | B. The Health, Education, and Human Services Committee is a Standing Committee of the | |
| 28 | Navajo Nation Council authorized to provide oversight of, and to review and recommend | |
| 29 | resolutions relating to, general governmental services and public health matters. 2 N.N.C. | |
| 30 | §400(C)(1), §401(B)(6)(a). | |

- C. The Law and Order Committee is a Standing Committee of the Navajo Nation Council with statutory oversight of law enforcement and public safety services on the Navajo Nation. 2 N.N.C. §600(C)(6). The Law and Order Committee is authorized to make recommendations to the Navajo Nation Council concerning amendments to the Navajo Nation Code. 2 N.N.C. §601(B)(14).
- D. The Naabik'íyáti' Committee is a Standing Committee of the Navajo Nation Council that reviews legislations requiring final action by the Navajo Nation Council. 2 N.N.C. §164(A)(9), 2 N.N.C. §701(A)(3).
- E. The Navajo Nation Council is the governing body of the Navajo Nation with the authority to review and approve amendments to Navajo Nation laws. 2 N.N.C. §102(A), 2 N.N.C. §164(A).

SECTION TWO. FINDINGS

- A. The purpose of the Navajo Nation's Animal Control Program ("NNACP"), among others, is to enforce the Navajo Nation's animal control laws by: (1) responding to complaints regarding dog bites and animal attacks; (2) investigating such incidents; (3) patrolling Navajo Nation communities; and (4) issuing citations for violations; all to protect the health, safety, and property of the Navajo People and their animals. **Exhibit A**, **Exhibit B**.
- B. Unfortunately, injuries to persons from dog bites and incidents of livestock injury from attacks by dogs and other animals consumes up to 85% of NNACP field officers' time; and the number of dogs running at large is alarming within all Navajo Nation communities. **Exhibit B**.
- C. Because of the COVID-19 pandemic, enforcement of the Navajo Nation's animal control laws has been severely impeded since the Spring of 2020, with several NNACP facilities closing. As well, the pandemic has reduced NNACP's efforts at spaying and neutering the dog population. Both circumstances have resulted in an unprecedented number of dogs running at large on the Navajo Nation.
- D. According to NNACP's website: "[t]he Navajo Nation currently lacks an effective Animal Control Program and adequate Animal Shelters. Because of this, we are unable to provide services in a variety of areas such as: aggressive enforcement of laws, vaccinations,

13

20 21 22

18

19

23 24

25

26 27

28 29

30

livestock damage investigations, animal-bite investigations, quarantines, adoptions, pick-up of stray/unwanted animals, dead animal disposal, and assisting with spay/neuter clinics. As a result, over 3,000 individuals are treated each year at hospitals and clinics for animal attacks and bites. The majority of victims are children and elderly. Some of these victims are transported to other hospitals for special treatment." Exhibit C.

- E. The NNACP website continues: "[c]urrently there are only five Animal Control Officers employed to address animal control issues for the entire Navajo Nation. These Officers can only provide services that have been determined as priority, such as bite cases and livestock damage. Officers are stationed in each of the five agencies (Ft. Defiance, Chinle, Shiprock, Tuba City and Crownpoint). Without an adequate Animal Control Program, we place the public's health and safety at risk." Exhibit C.
- F. According to the Navajo Times, the death of a teenage girl in Fort Defiance in May of 2021 was the fifth person killed by vicious dogs running at large on the Navajo Nation since 2010. The victims include a 56-year-old man near Gallup, New Mexico in 2010, an 8-yearold boy in Pine Hill, New Mexico in 2012, a 3-year-old boy in Seba Dalkai, Arizona in 2016, and a Kayenta woman in the fall of 2020.
- G. The most recent comprehensive study on this problem was addressed in a White Paper Analysis issued in January 2017 by NNACP. In this paper, NNACP reported: "[o]ver the last five years there has been increase in the severity of dog bite cases. The Animal Control Officers agree that the dogs are becoming more vicious and aggressive." Exhibit B. This White Paper was attached as an Exhibit to Resolution No. CJY-64-18, adopted in the Summer of 2018, that amended Title 3 and Title 13 of the Navajo Nation Code to address the roaming dog problem on the Navajo Nation. However, CJY-64-18 did not amend the Navajo Nation's criminal code to address the problem.
- H. In February of 2021, Navajo Nation President Jonathan Nez recognized that roaming dog attacks on the Navajo Nation have resulted in injuries and death to Navajo elderly folks and children, and present a serious danger to the general public. Exhibit D.
- I. Tragic deaths and injuries from dog attacks are avoidable, if the Navajo Nation implements severe penalties that would discourage the keeping and breeding of vicious dogs. Severe penalties would also deter persons from allowing their ferocious dogs and other dangerous

animals to run at large. Animal Control Officers should be given the authority to shoot on site those vicious dogs running at large, and other dangerous animals, that they determine to be a risk to the public's health, safety, or welfare.

- J. At this time, Navajo Nation law does not provide any criminal penalties that would deter persons from keeping vicious dogs or other dangerous animals that may attack. Neither does the Navajo Nation make it a crime for a person to allow their vicious dog or other dangerous animal to run at large, posing the danger of injuries or death to innocent persons. Therefore, an amendment to the Navajo Nation Criminal Code is needed to protect the public and to ensure that no one is ever again mauled to death or severely injured by a vicious dog, or other dangerous animal, that is running at large on the Navajo Nation.
- K. The purpose of the amendments to Title 17 approved herein is to better protect the public's health, safety, and welfare by defining a specific criminal offense and establishing certain criminal penalties for incidents involving injury or death as a result of an attack by a dog or other animal running at large.
- L. The Navajo Nation finds it in the best interest of the Navajo Nation and the Diné People to amend Title 17 of the Navajo Nation Code, as set forth herein.

SECTION THREE. AMENDING TITLE 17 OF THE NAVAJO NATION CODE.

The Navajo Nation hereby amends Title 17 of the Navajo Nation Code, as follows:

TITLE 17. LAW AND ORDER

§ 486. Criminal nuisance; Vicious dogs and other dangerous animals

- A. Offense. A person commits criminal nuisance if:
 - 1. By his or her conduct, activity, or behavior, whether by act or omission, which is either inherently unlawful in itself or unreasonable under all the circumstances, he or she knowingly, negligently, or recklessly creates, allows, facilitates, encourages, or maintains any condition, situation, incident, or occurrence that poses a risk to which endangers the safety, or health, or well-being of others any person(s) or the general public; or

- 2. He or she knowingly, conducts or maintains any premises, place or resort where persons negligently, or recklessly engages in, facilitates, or encourages in any manner, any gather for purposes of engaging in unlawful conduct, activity, or behavior, whether by act or omission, that poses a risk to the safety, health, or well-being of any person(s) or the general public; or
- 3. He or she knowingly, negligently, or recklessly allows a dog or other animal to run at large, and while running at large such dog or other animal lunges at, chases, or attacks in any manner, any other person and such person suffers any physical or mental injury and/or death.
 - (a) At the discretion of the Navajo Nation Prosecutor, a criminal nuisance violation under this §486(A)(3) may be charged against each and every person who allowed the dog or animal to run at large, or charged against each and every owner of the dog or animal, or charges may be brought against both.
 - (b) At the discretion of the Navajo Nation Prosecutor, a separate violation under this §486(A)(3) may be charged for each separate incident or occurrence resulting in any injury and/or death suffered by any person other than the alleged offender, and a separate violation may be charged for each person, other than the alleged offender, who suffers any injury and/or death as a result of such incident or occurrence.
 - (c) Teasing or provocation of the dog or animal in any manner by any person(s) shall not be a defense under this §486(A)(3), and shall not mitigate any penalty imposed for a conviction under this §486(A)(3).
 - (d) At the discretion of the Navajo Nation Prosecutor, a criminal nuisance violation under this §486(A)(3) may be charged in lieu of, or in addition to, the civil offenses established in 13 N.N.C. §§ 1702-1715, and the imposition of both civil and criminal penalties may be requested.
 - (e) Any dog or other animal running at large that any Navajo Nation Peace Officer determines has physically inflicted any physical or mental injury or death upon any person(s), or that the Officer in his/her discretion considers to be a risk to the health, safety, or welfare of any person(s) or the general public, may be immediately captured, contained, restrained, muzzled, and/or destroyed by the Officer. The cost

- for impoundment and care, and/or the destruction and disposal, of such dog or animal shall be charged to the person(s) convicted under this §486(A)(3).
- (f) For purposes of this §486(A)(3), "running at large" means that the dog or other animal is found or observed off the property of its owner and is not under the immediate and secure control of its owner or other designated person age 12 years or older, by chain or other tether, leash, fence, kennel, crate, or other adequate method.

 A dog or animal within any automobile or other vehicle of its owner or designee age 12 or older, shall be deemed upon/within the owner's or designee's property.

B. Sentence.

- 1. Any person found guilty of criminal nuisance may be sentenced to a term of imprisonment not to exceed 30 days, or be ordered to pay a fine not to exceed \$1,000, or both.
- 2. The trial court shall review all charges to ascertain whether there is a personal victim of the offense(s) and may order that restitution or nalyeeh shall be paid to the victim(s).
- 3. The trial court may utilize the services of the Navajo Peacemaking Program to determine nalyeeh and make a sentencing recommendation regarding that sentence, and the trial court may require the defendant to pay the fee of the peacemaker.
- 4. The trial court may impose a peace or security bond upon the defendant, including the pledges of family or clan sureties.
- 5. Upon the imposition of a bond or security pledges, the district Office of Probation and Parole shall counsel the sureties of the consequences of breach of the bond or pledge.
- 6. The trial court may impose community service sentences, to be served under the supervision of an organization or an individual designated by the court.
- 7. The punishment for each separate violation resulting in a conviction under §486(A)(3) shall be: (1) a term of imprisonment not less than 30 days and not more than 365 days; or (2) a fine not less than one-thousand-dollars (\$1000) and not more than five-thousand-dollars (\$5,000); or (3) the trial court may impose both punishments concurrently. The minimum sentencing provisions herein shall be imposed by the trial court notwithstanding §486(B)(1-6), and notwithstanding any civil fines provided for in 13 N.N.C. §§ 1702-1715. For two or more violations resulting in convictions, the terms

| of_ | imprisonment | shall | be | imposed | consecutively | and | fines | shall | be | imposed |
|-----|--------------|-------|----|---------|---------------|-----|-------|-------|----|---------|
| | | | | | • | | | | | - |
| cur | nulatively. | | | | | | | | | |

- 8. Those convicted under §486(A)(3) shall pay restitution for any costs incurred by the victim(s) as a result of any physical or mental injury and/or death suffered. This restitution payment shall not shield the person convicted from liability for civil fines under 13 N.N.C. §§ 1702-1715 or civil damages in any statutory or common-law civil action.
- 9. Those convicted under §486(A)(3) shall pay, in the event of death of the victim, restitution for any and all costs incurred on behalf of the deceased, including but not limited to, funeral and burial expenses. This restitution payment shall not shield the person convicted from liability for civil fines under 13 N.N.C. §§ 1702-1715 or civil damages in any statutory or common-law civil action.

* * * *

SECTION FOUR. CODIFICATION

The provisions of this resolution that amend or adopt new sections of the Navajo Nation Code shall be codified by the Office of Legislative Counsel. The Office of Legislative Counsel shall incorporate such amended provisions in the next codification of the Navajo Nation Code.

SECTION FIVE. SAVING CLAUSE

If any portion of this Act is determined invalid by the Navajo Nation Supreme Court or by a District Court of the Navajo Nation, without appeal to the Navajo Nation Supreme Court, the remainder of this Act shall remain the law of the Navajo Nation.

SECTION SIX. EFFECTIVE DATE

The provisions of this Act shall become effective according to 2 N.N.C. §221(B).