THE NAVAJO NATION LEGISLATIVE BRANCH INTERNET PUBLIC REVIEW PUBLICATION



LEGISLATION NO: _0167-25__ SPONSOR: <u>Eugenia Charles-Newton</u>

TITLE: An Act Relating to Health, Education and Human Services, Law and Order, and Naabik'íyáti' Committees and the Navajo Nation Council; Amending 15 N.N.C. §§ 303, 305 and 308, the Plan of Operation of the Navajo Nation Labor Commission

Date posted: <u>July 01, 2025 at 8:04PM</u>

Digital comments may be e-mailed to comments@navajo-nsn.gov

Written comments may be mailed to:

Executive Director
Office of Legislative Services
P.O. Box 3390
Window Rock, AZ 86515
(928) 871-7586

Comments may be made in the form of chapter resolutions, letters, position papers, etc. Please include your name, position title, address for written comments; a valid e-mail address is required. Anonymous comments will not be included in the Legislation packet.

Please note: This digital copy is being provided for the benefit of the Navajo Nation chapters and public use. Any political use is prohibited. All written comments received become the property of the Navajo Nation and will be forwarded to the assigned Navajo Nation Council standing committee(s) and/or the Navajo Nation Council for review. Any tampering with public records are punishable by Navajo Nation law pursuant to 17 N.N.C. *§374 et. seq.*

Tracking No. <u>0167-25</u>

DATE: June 24, 2025

TITLE OF RESOLUTION: AN ACT RELATING TO HEALTH, EDUCATION AND HUMAN SERVICES, LAW AND ORDER, AND NAABIK'ÍYÁTI' COMMITTEES AND THE NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL; AMENDING 15 N.N.C. §§ 303, 305 AND 308, THE PLAN OF OPERATION OF THE NAVAJO NATION LABOR COMMISSION

PURPOSE: This resolution, if approved, would amend 15 N.N.C. §§ 303, 305 and 308, The Plan of Operation of the Navajo Nation Labor Commission.

FINAL AUTHORITY: Navajo Nation Council

VOTE REQUIRED: Simple Majority

This written summary does not address recommended amendments as may be provided by the standing committees. The Office of Legislative Counsel requests each Council Delegate to review each proposed resolution in detail.

5-DAY BILL H	OLD PERIOD: Health Education & Human Services C	
Posting End		Thence
Eligible for A		Thence
1	PROPOSED NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL RESOLUTION Naabik'íyáti' C	mmittee
2	25th NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL - Third Year, 2025	Thence
3	Introduced by:	Council
. 4		Č
5		
6	(Sponsor)	
7		
8	Tracking No	
9		
10	AN ACT	
11	RELATING TO HEALTH, EDUCATION AND HUMAN SERVICES, LAW AND	
12	ORDER, AND NAABIK'ÍYÁTI' COMMITTEES AND THE NAVAJO NATION	
13	COUNCIL; AMENDING 15 N.N.C. §§ 303, 305 AND 308, THE PLAN OF	
14	OPERATION OF THE NAVAJO NATION LABOR COMMISSION	
. 15		
16	BE IT ENACTED:	
17		
18	SECTION ONE. AUTHORITIES	
19	A. The Law and Order Committee is a standing committee of the Navajo Nation Council	
. 20	and has the power to review and make recommendations to the Navajo Nation Council	
21	on proposed amendments to and enactments in the Navajo Nation Code; and the	
22	Committee is the legislative oversight committee for the Navajo Nation Labor	
23	Commission. 2 N.N.C. §§ 164(A), 600(A), 601(B)(14) and (C)(1).	
24	B. The Health, Education, and Human Services Committee is a standing committee of the	
25	Navajo Nation Council and has the power to review and recommend resolutions relating	
26	to employment and labor. 2 N.N.C. §§ 400(A), 401(B)(6)(a).	
27	C. The Naabik'íyáti' Committee is a standing committee of the Navajo Nation Council and	
28	has the power to review proposed legislation which requires final action by the Navajo	
29	Nation Council. 2 N.N.C. §§ 164(A)(9) and 700(A).	
30	D. The Navajo Nation Council is the governing body of the Navajo Nation and must review	

and approve enactments or amendments of positive law. 2 N.N.C. §§ 102(A) and 164(A).

3

SECTION TWO. FINDINGS

- 4 5
- 6
- 7
- 9
- 10 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21 22
- 23
- 24
- 25
- 2627
- 28
- 29
- 30

- A. The Navajo Nation Labor Commission ("Commission" or "NNLC") is a quasi-judicial body of the Navajo Nation Government established to hear, adjudicate and decide all
 - complaints filed under the Navajo Preference in Employment ("NPEA") pursuant to 15
 - N.N.C. §§ 301-308.
- B. The NNLC is established and has powers prescribed in its Plan of Operation as well as such additional powers as may be conferred to the Commission by law pursuant to 15
 - N.N.C. § 301.
- C. In July 2016, the Navajo Nation Council by Resolution CJY-42-16 (effective date
- October 1, 2017) changed the qualification of the five-member Commission to require
 - all Commissioners to be members of the Navajo Nation Bar Association, Inc. ("NNBA")
 - and two Commissioners to be attorneys licensed in New Mexico, Arizona, or Utah. The
 - Commission office normally advertises for applicants, however, in late 2016 and 2017,
 - the Commission, the Speaker's Office, and the Office of the President/Vice-President
 - vigorously advertised for applicants using the amended qualifications. The vacancies
 - were also announced to the NNBA membership, on the NNBA website, and at NNBA
 - events, including the annual NNBA Bar Conference; and
- D. On September 31, 2017, the terms of the then-Commissioners expired. At that time, the
 - Commission had no confirmed commissioners; and
- E. On February 22, 2018, the Naabik'íyáti' Committee by Resolution NABIF-11-18
 - confirmed Loretta Danzuka (tribal court advocate), who was appointed by President
 - Russell Begay, for a four-year term. Ms. Danzuka's term subsequently expired in 2022;
 - and
- F. On March 8, 2018, the Naabik'íyáti' Committee by Resolution NABIMA-22-18
 - confirmed Edward Dobson (an attorney licensed with the Navajo Nation and Arizona),
 - who was appointed by President Russell Begaye, for a four-year term; and
- G. From October 1, 2017 (which is the effective date of new qualifications) to around May
- 2018, the Commission was comprised of two-members and was unable to hold hearings

for lack of a quorum; and

- H. Around May 2018, the attorney for Petitioner Austin Bahe filed a Writ (Bahe v NNLC and Concerning NECA) to the Navajo Nation Supreme Court requesting the Court to direct the Commission to hold hearings; and
- I. On May 23, 2018, the Navajo Nation Supreme Court issued a PERMANENT WRIT OF MANDAMUS that ordered the Commission to conduct and hold hearings and ordered the Commission to be comprised of previously appointed Commissioners and newly appointed Commissioner to hear and adjudicate cases without further delay, a copy of the WRIT is attached hereto as EXHIBIT "A"; and
- J. On June 6, 2018, the Health, Education, and Human Services Committee by Resolution HEHSCJN-08-18 appointed and confirmed Nona L. Etsitty (tribal court advocate) for four-year term. Ms. Etsitty's term subsequently expired in 2022; and
- K. On June 6, 2018, the Health, Education, and Human Services Committee by Resolution HEHSCJN-09-18 confirmed Marvin Beauvais (an attorney licensed with the Navajo Nation and Washington), who was appointed by President Russell Begaye, for a fouryear term. At that time, the Commission had four newly appointed Commissioners; and
- L. On June 29, 2018, the Navajo Nation Supreme Court issued an *Opinion* that previously appointed Commissioners may continue service on the Commission until such time a successor is appointed and confirmed. See *Bahe v. NNLC*, No. SC-CV-15-18, *Writ of Mandamus* dated May 23, 2018 and *Opinion* dated June 29, 2018. The Court stated the NPEA has statutory deadlines and time requirements. In *Bahe*, the Court reviewed past Navajo Nation resolutions that amended the Commission's plan of operation. Specifically, the Court examined Resolution LOCMY-01-14 and concluded the resolution did not underline nor strike out statutory changes in Title 15. The Court also stated the Commissioners must serve until successors are appointed and confirmed, and that previously appointed Commissioners and newly appointed Commissioners must hear and adjudicate cases without delay. As a result of the *Writ* and *Opinion*, the Commission and Commission office contacted former Commissioners to serve on the Commission until their successors are appointed and confirmed, a copy of the Opinion is attached hereto as **EXHIBIT "B"**; and

3 of 7 25-248-1

- M. Around mid-to-late 2018, Mr. Dobson and Beauvais resigned. Upon the resignation of the attorneys, the Commission only had two newly confirmed Commissioners (Loretta Danzuka and Nona L. Etcitty). Since the resignation of the two attorneys, there have been no attorneys appointed; and
- N. From late 2018 to present, the Commission has been holding hearings with former Commissioners (Marie Etsitty received an October 31, 2014 appointment letter from the former Speaker LoRenzo C. Bates. Under the Plan of Operation, at the time, the Speaker was authorized to appoint a Commissioner and there was no need for a standing committee resolution. Ben C. Smith was appointed by President Joe Shirley, Jr. in 2009 and confirmed by Government Services Committee Resolution GSCAP-11-09 on April 16, 2009. Jerry Bodie, then-Navajo Nation Council Delegate in 1996, was appointed by Human Services Committee Resolution HSCJN-30-96 and confirmed by Government Services Committee Resolution GSCJN-36-96 on June 11, 1996. Under the Plan of Operation, at the time, a Council Delegate on the Human Services Committee could be appointed to the Commission); and
- O. On October 10, 2019, the Naabik'íyáti' Committee by Resolution NABIO-58-19 confirmed Casey Watchman (tribal court advocate), who was appointed by President Jonathan Nez, for a four-year term. Mr. Watchman's term expired in 2023; and
- P. In 2020 to 2022, the Commission worked with the Navajo Nation Council, Speaker, and oversight committee to amend the Plan of Operation; and
- Q. On July 26, 2022, the Navajo Nation Council by Resolution CJY-40-22 approved amendments to the Plan of Operation. On August 14, 2022, President Jonathan Nez vetoed the Resolution; and
- R. On August 15, 2023, the Health, Education, and Human Services Committee by Resolution HEHSCAU-15-23 reappointed and reconfirmed Nona L. Etsitty (tribal court advocate) for a four-year term; and
- S. On May 28, 2024, the Health, Education, and Human Services Committee appointed and confirmed Richie Nez, Sr. for a four-year term; and
- T. Presently, the Commission has two Commissioners (Nona Etsitty and Richie Nez, Sr.) with unexpired terms. The remaining Commissioners (Loretta Danzuka, Casey

Watchman, Marie Nez, Ben Smith and Jerry Bodie) have expired terms and serve as Commissioners per the *Bahe Opinion* and *Writ*; and

- U. It is necessary to amend the qualifications for Commissioners because the 2016 qualifications for Commissioners are unworkable. Since 2016, only two attorneys have been appointed and confirmed, and they resigned after a few months. The work of the Commission is demanding: evidentiary hearings can last for 8 hours and may take two days or more; Commissioners must know the Navajo Preference in Employment Act, human resources, employment practices and law, and applicable Navajo Nation Supreme Court opinions/memorandum decisions/orders, Commissioners must rule on motions and procedural matters; receive, rule on, exclude, and limit evidence, lines of questioning and testimony; determine relevancy, materiality, and repetitious nature of evidence; examine witnesses; issue findings of fact and conclusions of law; and impose damages, sanctions, fines and other remedies. They are called upon to decide matters of federal Indian law, Navajo Nation caselaw, Navajo due process and k'é, Diné bi beenahaz'áanii, traditional law, customary law, and natural law. Various pro se parties, tribal court advocates, attorneys, and law firms litigate before the Commission. The stipend of \$250.00 per hearing day is insufficient to attract and retain new Commissioners, specifically tribal court advocates, and to adequately compensate Commissioners; and
- V. There is a need for the Health, Education, and Human Services Committee of the Navajo Nation Council to appoint and confirm a majority of Commissioners because the Office of the President has not appointed a single Commissioner since 2019, almost 6 years ago; and
- W. The Commission by Resolution NNLCMAY-21-2025 has approved and recommended amendments to their plan of operation, attached hereto as **EXHIBIT C**.
- X. It is in the best interest of the Navajo Nation to amend 15 N.N.C. §§ 303, 305 and 308, the Plan of Operation of the Navajo Nation Labor Commission.

2728

18 19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

SECTION THREE. AMENDMENTS TO 15 N.N.C. §§ 303, 305, 308

The Navajo Nation hereby amends the Navajo Nation Code, Title 15 as follows:

30

29

Title 15. Labor

Chapter 4. Navajo Nation Labor Commission

§ 303. Organization

The Commission shall consist of five members.

- A. Membership. The Commission shall consist of: (23) two three members appointed by the Health, Education, and Human Services Committee of the Navajo Nation Council; and (32) threetwo members appointed by the President of the Navajo Nation with the concurrence of the Naabik'iyati' Committee of the Navajo Nation Council.
- B. Commission Members Qualifications.
 The five Commission members shall be 1) familiar with the Navajo Nation's labor practices, human resources and employment; and 2) member of the Navajo Nation Bar in good standing, and; 3) two Commission members shall be licensed to practice law in either Arizona, New Mexico or Utah.

4. The Commission may recall former members to complete pending cases- or to establish a quorum when necessary.

D. Term of Office. Each member of the Commission shall serve for a term of four (4) years and until his or her successor is appointed <u>and confirmed</u>.

§ 305. Meetings/hearings/deliberative sessions; procedure

D. Members of the Commission shall receive a two-hundred fifty dollar (\$250.00) five hundred dollar (\$500.00) stipend and shall be reimbursed for lodging, meals, expenses and mileage (at the Navajo Nation rate) incurred in connection with the performance of their duties. Commission members shall be eligible for any insurance provided by the Navajo Nation to its employees, other boards, commissions, elected officials and other tribal entities. All Commission expenses shall be paid from the budget of the Commission.

6 of 7

* * *

-248-1

1	§ 308. Amendment
2	This Plan of Operation may be amended from time to time by the Intergovernmental Relations
3	Committee of the Navajo Nation Council. Prior to any such amendment, the Health,
4	Education, and Human Services Committee shall review and recommend any change or
5	proposed amendment to this Plan of Operation.
6	
7	
8	SECTION FOUR. CODIFICATION
9	The provisions of these amendments of the Navajo Nation Code shall be codified by the
10	Office of Legislative Counsel. The Office of Legislative Counsel shall incorporate such
11	amended provisions in the next codification of the Navajo Nation Code.
12	
13	SECTION FIVE. SAVINGS CLAUSE
14	Should any provisions of these amendments be determined invalid by the Navajo Nation
15	Supreme Court, or the District Courts of the Navajo Nation, without appeal to the Navajo
16	Nation Supreme Court, those amendments that are not determined invalid shall remain the
17	law of the Navajo Nation.
18	
19	SECTION SIX. EFFECTIVE DATE
20	The Navajo Nation Code amendment enacted herein shall be effective pursuant to pursuant
21	to 2 N.N.C. § 221(B).
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	·
27	
28	
29	
30	